



JANUARY 23, 2019
BOARD OF TRUSTEES MEETING
WILLIAM G. PORTER BOARDROOM
8:00 a.m.

MEETING MINUTES

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. ROLL CALL

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

Trudy Bartley, Chair
Jean Carter Ryan
Cathy De Rosa
Thomas Grote
Amy Landino
Marlon Moore
David Norstrom
Gina Ormond
Letty Schamp
Timothy Skinner
Michael Stevens
Craig Treneff

3. APPROVAL OF THE DECEMBER 12, 2018 BOARD OF TRUSTEES MEETING MINUTES

- Chair Bartley motioned to approved the December 12, 2018 Board of Trustees Meeting Minutes. Trustee Treneff 2nd the motion. Minutes approved.
- Chair Bartley motioned to amend the minutes to reflect the change of The Columbus Foundations anniversary to reflect 75th Anniversary. Trustee Treneff 2nd the motion. Motion approved.

4. COMMENTS OR STATEMENTS FROM THE AUDIENCE

- Cynthia Pugh and Ms. Lucas with Prudence Learning Center to implement a reading center at COTA's Easton location. They would be responsible for managing the Easton location library. If

COTA would partner with them, it would make COTA a smart company providing an opportunity to help foster reading with our COTA riders. There would be no cost to COTA.

- A letter from a COTA rider Melanie Cornelius who was on a bus that broke down on 315 and a second breakdown shortly thereafter. Ms. Cornelius wrote a letter to Matt Allison complimenting COTA on the noticeable improvements the maintenance team has made.

5. PRESIDENT'S REMARKS

- Reflect on where we were in 2018 and where we are going in 2019. Besides winning the National Award for Outstanding Public Transit in the Nation, if you recall on January 1, 2018 we launched the first rapid transit, the CMAX that runs along the Cleveland corridor, in 2017 we provided 1.3 million rides and we grew the CMAX in one by 17.4% or 1.55 million riders. CMAX is funded 80% federally and 20% locally. In 2019 we look to MORPC and the Urban Land Institute sharing with us the five major corridors where they see the potential for growth densification as we add 1 million people to our community, we have a play book and we know how to do it and we are seeing demonstrated success.
- In 2018 we invested in the C-Pass program which ended the year with a 45-percent enrollment rate among eligible businesses. C-pass accounted for 524,720 rides this year, beginning with 44,642 in June, spiking at 100,425 during the fall and ending the year at 81,351 trips in December. Our team will work with the External Stakeholders Committee to set goals for 2019. What percentage of businesses do we want to enroll? How many people do we want using the system? How many customers do we want to serve? This will help us determine how we should expand C-pass. Our recommendation is we expand and this is not just the pilot that expires in 22 months. It's how do we make C-pass 2.0.
- Team did some benchmarking in Nevada and met with more than 16 companies who have data, Artificial Intelligence and advanced mobility technology piece. These are companies who can help us launch microtransit.
- Our Strategic Plan consultant you will hear a briefing today and starting next month our Board will be able to engage in a feedback of strategic themes. We had more than 10% or 130 of our employees participated in the SWOT analysis on where they see the future of COTA and they want to be engaged and help us move forward, so we are really trying build that One COTA/ Team COTA brand.

- Watched the video on The Big Explorer. We had a 78% increase in ridership on December 27, 2018 for The Big Explorer and our employees performed seamlessly that day.
- Chair Bartley commented that she and Joanna attended an event on January 22, 2019 called True Originals at The Columbus Foundation and it seems that COTA is at the tip of everyone's tongue. People are getting on the bus, engaging and having relationships. COTA is a mobility solution for everyone, no matter your socioeconomic status. We heard that from all the groups who participated in The Big Explorer. Doug Kridler is a huge proponent and how he and Joanna were on the bus at 5:00am that day talking to customers about who they are and why they are participating, because of this Jeni's gave \$20,000 to The Columbus Foundation and this reflects the impact. It shows the value proposition for the community. We need to be a part of something like this in the future. COTA will be a part of the solutions. Chair Bartley thanks the staff for all their hard work.

6. GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE REPORT – TRUDY BARTLEY, CHAIR

- No report on Governance.

7. STRATEGIC AND OPERATIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT - CRAIG TRENEFF, CHAIR

- Glenn Taylor provided an update at the committee meeting on January 9, 2019. Phase 1 of the strategic plan is completed and now in phase 2 which includes internal and external interviews.
- Discussed MaaS and reiterated the focus of first/last mile with focus on customer first and targeting low income and minority communities.
- Three major strategic directions, one community advisement and partnerships, second is partnership with mobility partners and third is COTA operated first/last mile. There are five task forces working on this matter, including one on branding and one on funding. Community advisement and partnership includes, Grove City Connection Park and Ride with Mt. Carmel; Dublin senior shuttle that will connect retirement communities to shopping and our bus stops. Will focus on staff to get the public to restaurants, shopping and more. Six zones have been identified for MaaS, Polaris, Westerville, Hamilton Road and 161 corridor and both north and south Linden. Partnership with mobility provides, 7th Floor mobility lab with our first tenant, Empower Bus. COTA operated service we are looking at launching two pilot projects in 2019, on demand operated service, MORPC will fund about \$946,000 and we are seeking partners for additional funding options.

- Discussion of Mobility Hubs that our Park n Rides would be a place our mobility riders have a space and solution of our customers first/last mile. Provide a national footprint for the COTA riders and will have a resolution in the future.

8. EXTERNAL/STAKEHOLDER RELATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT - MARLON MOORE, CHAIR

- External Stakeholders Relations Committee met on January 14, 2019. Discussed the strategic plan that was on time and under budget. Suggestion by one of our Trustees to reach out to the LGBTQ community to be interviewed, really shows a comprehensive approach to how we engage the entire community and all our riders feel welcomed.
- Diversity and Inclusion update, we exceeded our DBE goals in 2018 and set additional goals going forward. Had an In depth discussion of doing business with DBE businesses and will focus on partnering and create it as part of our strategy with local business owners and our workforce to reflect our ridership in the community. The team will create a comprehensive strategy.
- Corporate engagement and how we provide our service for our corporate partners. Michael Loges will put together a strategy on how we meet the needs of our corporations. A full strategy should be ready end of first quarter.
- Legislative update strategy to not just focus on federal level, but also at the state and local level. As part of the Government shutdown 90% of federal employees are furloughed and how can we support our community stewards.
- Talked about the impact of The Big Explorer. COTA stepped up and provide our community to see venues that they may normally not see.
 - RESOLUTION NO. 2019-01 - AUTHORIZING FREE FARES FOR FEDERAL EMPLOYEES IMPACTED BY THE GOVERNMENT SHUTDOWN
 - Trustee Moore commented that how proud he is that our staff is looking out for others and thought leadership to put forth a resolution to provide free transportation for federal employees. 90% of federal employees impacted by the shutdown and how we can support our community. Trustee Moore was excited to be a part of a great team to bring this to my attention to offer free fare to the federal employees impacted.
 - Joanna discussed the various pop ups such as food banks, diaper banks, and other various companies to assist the impacted employees. COTA would like to offer a pop up Mobility Bank to provide a 31 day COTA pass for free transit.

- Laura Koprowski discussed the caring nature here at COTA and the generosity by providing a 31 day pass for the federal employees who are impacted to use the local and express services. Federal employees will need to show their Federal ID and documentation to show they are furloughed. Trustee Norstrom asked, if it is a family pass or just for the employee? He suggest we offer it to family. Trustee Landino asked, what are the hours of operations for employees to come down and obtain a pass? Laura commented our office is open 8am-5pm. We will look at a solution to help those who are unable to make it downtown to pick up a pass. Joanna commented we are not aware of the neighborhoods with impacts and with socialization and discussion to get the word out. Trustee DeRosa suggested maybe looking at the airport employees and providing passes to them to help get the word out and assist in getting these employees to work. Trustee Skinner asked, if this will be put out to those not working without pay? Laura stated yes. Trustee Ryan asked, what the marketing plan is to get the word out to the impacted employees? Laura stated we will work with closely with our community partners, we are sending out our newsletter to our customers and will also share this with the media. Trustee Moore Moore stated we will be learning along the way and the key is to provide to those in need. Trustee Grote asked, if we know how many are impacted in Columbus? Laura stated we know 10,000 employees are federal employees with 6,500 are impacted and that is how determined our estimation. Trustee Norstrom asked, if we have been in contact with any unions that would be aware of impact? Laura commented that we will look into it. Chair Bartley asked about Whitehall and DCSC? Laura stated we will confirm and understand at this point they are not impacted. Trustee Landino asked how long will this go on to allow those to obtain a pass? Laura commented we did not state a timeline to pick up. Trustee Norstrom asked, if we thought about contractors impacted? Joanna said that as part of the outreach plan that we need to look at contractors. Trustee Moore would like to amend this to make it available to contractors working at a federal level. Joanna said she trust that our team will look at the criteria to determine those who are impacted based on documentation. If we include contractors, documentation will be shown that would meet the threshold of a furloughed impacted federal employee. Trustee Skinner asked, if there is a way to track? Laura stated yes. Trustee Moore asked that we approved this resolution. Chair Bartley stated we need to consider those on federal grant programs and looking at it

from a budgetary standpoint and the impact it can have. Trustee Ryan agreed we need..... Trustee Norstrom asked that in section 1 that we add to include Contractors. Trustee Marlon approves to amend and moves forward to pass the resolution.

- Trustee Norstrom 2nd the motion. Motion passed.

9. PERFORMANCE MONITORING/AUDIT COMMITTEE REPORT - MICHAEL STEVENS, CHAIR

Trustee Stevens would like to recognize the COTA employees on being able to move people this past weekend during the weather that impacted the communities.

- On January 16, 2019 the committee met and discussed the quarterly reporting on ridership fixed route trend positively at 3.6% higher than target and 2.4% higher than goal, and compared to other agencies are down about 13%; high frequency corridor are increasing 2.1% over Q3. AirConnect ridership showed the most dramatic increase with Q2 and Q3 leading the way. Cbus had a slight decline throughout the year likely due to the C-Pass program providing downtown workers more options for travel along High St. Productivity on Saturday and Sunday continue to lag significantly behind the weekday ridership. The Q4 productivity was down slightly as expected due to seasonality. Trustee Ryan commented one of our goals was to hit 25 million rides by 2025, and as we look at these trends if there was discussion on how the positive upward trends turning upward enough. How are we trying to hit the goal? Trustee Stevens replied the team will report back to the Board.
- PRESENTATION: 2018 PIC PERFORMANCE REVIEW/2019 PIC GOALS
 - Terri Eyerman reviewed the PIC program objectives that rewards employees to meet the company's objectives.
 - 2018 pic performance v. goals. expense control is all or nothing and we did meet the goal with a payout of 50% for expense control; fixed route came in at 9% and paratransit came in at 6%; fixed route customer satisfaction came in at 0% payout for net complaints; the result of annual survey came in at 4% for fixed route; for paratransit complaints came in at 2%; service reliability for fixed route and paratransit came in at 0%; safe operations for fixed route and paratransit came in at 5%; fixed route for recordable injury rate came in at 5% for paratransit and fixed route. Overall fixed route payout was 73% of maximum and paratransit was 70% of maximum.

- Trustee DeRosa asked to explain the difference of goal v. target. Terri explained it is a range with a sliding scale with a target we want to meet and a goal that we are working toward. In between there is different ranges and we have to hit between the target and the goal to get the payout.
 - Proposed payout participation for fixed route non representative / representative of mobility services is calculated at \$1,363,437 and the individuals who stayed with longevity program the payout is \$68,598 with a total payout for all is \$1,432,035 and is \$1,009,030 under budget; 3.5% for eligible employees, 3.65% for eligible administrative employees and 2.19% for eligible represented employees.
 - Trustee Treneff asked about the target for service reliability and performance for paratransit. Is there service or lack of reliability issue for our fixed ROUTE? Amy Hockman commented our vehicles are little older which effected some of our reliability. We recently traded out the old with the new and saw improved timing. Trustee Treneff asked, how often we trade out? Amy stated we budget about 20 a year. Trustee Treneff asked, if the goal that is the same for 2019 and 2018 if we will meet that goal. Amy stated yes. Trustee Norstrom stated we should look at changing the goal if the staff hasn't met that goal for four years. Trustee Stevens asked, if there were further questions? Trustee DeRosa asked if all targets were hit at full level would that have hit the \$2.4 million. Joanna stated this is the one time you don't want to come in under budget.

- Trustee Stevens presented the following resolutions for approval:
 - RESOLUTION NO. 2019-02 – APPROVING THE LEVEL OF COMPENSATION PAYOUT FOR THE 2018 PERFORMANCE INCENTIVE COMPENSATION (PIC) PROGRAM
 - Trustee Stevens motions to pass. Trustee Skinner 2nd. Chair Bartley moves to pass.
 - RESOLUTION NO. 2019-03 – APPROVING THE 2019 PERFORMANCE GOALS FOR COTA's PERFORMANCE INCENTIVE COMPENSATION (PIC) PROGRAM STAFF SUMMARY
 - Trustee Stevens motions to pass. Trustee Grote 2nd. Chair Bartley moves to pass.

10. CONSENT AGENDA

- RESOLUTION NO. 2019-04 – AUTHORIZING A GOVERNMENTAL COMMERCIAL CARD AGREEMENT WITH THE HUNTINGTON NATIONAL BANK
- RESOLUTION NO. 2019-05 – AUTHORIZING EXPENDITURES FOR AN ENTERPRISE RESOURCE PLANNING SYSTEM SUPPORT AGREEMENT WITH INFOR (US), INC.
- RESOLUTION NO.2019-06 – AUTHORIZING A CONTRACT WITH MCKEE DOOR SALES, INC. FOR ON-CALL REPAIR OF GATE OPERATORS, OVERHEAD DOORS AND PEDESTRIAN DOORS
 - Chair Bartley motions to approve the above Resolutions on consent. Trustee Ryan 2nd the motion. Trustee Moore abstained from resolution 2019-04. Motion passed.

11. OTHER BUSINESS

- No other business.

12. MEETING CALENDAR

- STRATEGIC AND OPERATIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE – FEBRUARY 6, 2019, 9:00 a.m.
- EXTERNAL STAKEHOLDER RELATIONS COMMITTEE – FEBRUARY 11, 2019, 3:30 p.m.
- PERFORMANCE MONITORING/AUDIT COMMITTEE – FEBRUARY 20, 2019, 2:00 p.m.
- GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE – FEBRUARY 20, 2019, 3:00 p.m.
- BOARD OF TRUSTEES – FEBRUARY 27, 2019, 8:00 a.m.

13. ADJOURNMENT

- Motion to move to adjournment. Trustee Stevens 2nd. Meeting adjourned at 9:09am.

Adopted: January 23, 2019

Signed: 
Chair, Board of Trustees

Attest: 
President/CEO